

The Carmelites

The Province of St Elias

By: Alfred Isacsson, O.Carm.

**Vestigium Press
90 Euclid Ave
PO Box 883
Middletown, NY 10940**

**Copyright © 2003
Alfred J. Isacsson
All Rights Reserved
ISBN # 0-9710197-5-4**

Table of Contents

Chapter 1	The First Foundation	3
Chapter 2	Expansion	7
Chapter 3	Further Growth	11
Chapter 4	Life in Manhattan	15
Chapter 5	The Irish Freedom Movement	19
Chapter 6	To a Commissary	22
Chapter 7	The Flanagan Years	25
Chapter 8	Life in the 30's and 40's	30
Chapter 9	The Old Houses 1950 – 90	35
Chapter 10	The Most Recent Days	41

Chapter 1

The First Foundation

Despite the ruin that came to the Carmelite Order through secularism and government controls of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, it survived in Ireland even though, it had its local problem of English persecution. Because of government restrictions affecting education, those desiring to join the Carmelite Order had to go abroad, usually to Spain or Italy, to complete their studies. Restrictions curtailing ministry, the Irish wanderlust and stories of the land that lay across the Atlantic caused Irish Carmelites to be scouts, coming on their own to the United States for holidays. London and Toronto, Canada, both desired to have the Carmelites but nothing came of these attempts.

After the middle of the nineteenth century, there were more Irish aspirants for the order than could be educated and usefully employed in Ireland so there was established at *Santa Maria in Traspontina* in Rome a novitiate for any nationals who desired to serve the Church in the Carmelite Order wherever there was a need. Some of the Irish, who went there and were ordained, came to Maryland, Kentucky and Niagara Falls to work in Carmelite houses. Some of the houses failed and some endured to become eventually part of the American Province of the Most Pure Heart of Mary.

At the Irish Provincial Chapter of 1887, John Bartley was elected for his second term as provincial. Besides the missions in Australia, there were six houses in Ireland and forty was the number of men in the province. In that same year of 1887, the Carmelite, Michael A. Moore, was in New York. What his business was, we do not know. He had received authorization to collect funds for the Irish Carmelites in Australia and in North and South America. We know he went to South America and had a successful venture, may have gone to Australia and could have been in the United State to raise money. In New York, he met a New York priest named James McMahan. He had been the pastor of Saint John the Evangelist in Manhattan until the parish was absorbed into the territory of the newly completed Saint Patrick's Cathedral. He became the pastor of Manhattan's Saint Andrew's in 1880 and he was in this post when Michael Moore met him.

On September 5, 1887, James McMahan offered Moore an endowed foundation for the Carmelites on Manhattan's West Side. It was to be on land that McMahan owned on the west side of Central Park in the vicinity of the present Museum of Natural History. Moore went in a few days to see Michael A. Corrigan, the Archbishop of New York, whose response was interpreted by Moore as being favorable. This he reported to McMahan and received from his provincial, John Bartley, the green light to secure this foundation. When Corrigan met with his consultors that September, they pointed out to him that the acceptance of McMahan's offer would place another parish in an area already served by a sufficient number of parishes.

McMahon would not allow his offer to be situated in any other site and Corrigan and his chancery officials remained adamant in their position. Moore kept John Bartley informed and must have been writing Rome, for the offer and its refusal was brought to the attention of Cardinal Simeoni, the prefect of *Propaganda Fide*, the Roman congregation that oversaw the Church in the United States at that time.

Cardinal Simeoni asked Archbishop Corrigan for an explanation of his actions. His response was a condemnation of Father McMahon. Corrigan cited the falsehood of many claims McMahon had made to Michael Moore. He lashed out at him for not building a school at Saint Andrew's and using the funds raised for this purpose to build himself an expansive rectory. The land he planned to give the Carmelites was obtained through foreclosure and he also owned a hotel in Long Branch, a New Jersey summer resort area. John Bartley never gave up hope for a New York foundation and came to the United States in September, 1888 to see if he could secure the McMahon offer.

In his correspondence with Cardinal Simeoni, Archbishop Corrigan presented the offer of an east side parish to the Carmelites. This was to be cut from the parish of Saint Stephen and included the care of Bellevue Hospital. One reason for this offer was that the Saint Stephen's pastor, Doctor Edward McGlynn, had been excommunicated by Rome in July, 1887 for what were called acts of insubordination. Seeing in the economic theories of Henry George relief for his poverty stricken parishioners, McGlynn promoted his works to the chagrin of Corrigan who saw George's ideas as being contrary to Catholic teaching. The Saint Stephen's parishioners, most of whom were Irish, held meetings in support of McGlynn and to some extent withheld their financial support of the parish. Corrigan apparently saw the Irish Carmelites as being simpatico with these dissidents and having studied in Rome, being able to communicate with the Italian immigrants. If the Carmelites took his offer and they were able to gain McMahon's benefice, it would be a boon to Corrigan. John Bartley's trip to the United States was to appraise the situation and, hopefully, obtain the McMahon benefice. Bartley stayed in the United States with the Carmelites at Saint Cecilia's in Englewood, New Jersey. He saw Corrigan and McMahon and was not able to gain the west side site from Corrigan or McMahon's benefice for any other location. The Englewood Carmelites advised Bartley to accept the east side parish. By the end of December, 1888, the Carmelites agreed to accept the parish and also to follow Corrigan's wishes in the purchase and deeding of the church's property. Bartley received permission to proceed from the general, Angelo Savini.

Towards the end of January, 1889, John Bartley completed the purchase of seven lots, four on East 28th Street and three on East 29th Street for the sum of \$70,000. After making arrangements for temporary living quarters, Bartley left on February 13 for Ireland to enlist the men he would need for the parish. He arrived home towards the end of that month.

John Bartley not only must have been anxious about beginning the new parish but he also worked fast as he returned to New York with his three Carmelite recruits on the *S. S. Germanic* on March 29, 1889. They were: Philip McDonnell, Edward Southwell and Michael Daly. From the boat, the Carmelites went to Sinclair House, Broadway and 8th Street. This hotel was a favorite stopping place for clergy and was run by the Ashmans, a prominent Irish Catholic family. It was

here that the Carmelites became acquainted with Mrs. Ashman who would later assist them in their fund raising efforts.

From Sinclair House, the fathers moved to a rental at 336 East 30th Street where they remained until a permanent site for a priory was purchased at 338 East 29th Street. This building was situated at the rear of the church yet to be built and would have a passageway from the priory into the sacristy. While all of the above was taking place, Michael A. Moore made his way to Rome and composed a document to be presented to *Propaganda Fide* accusing Archbishop Corrigan of preventing the Carmelites from obtaining a benefice that was rightfully theirs. The document citing excerpts from Corrigan letters was printed and had to have been presented to the congregation in late 1888 or early 1889, exactly the time when John Bartley was negotiating with Corrigan.

Corrigan's mail of April 5, 1889 brought him a double dose of bad news. The first was the April issue of the *American Ecclesiastical Review* which contained an article by Pius Mayer, then an Assistant General of the Carmelite Order, dealing with the Brown Scapular. One statement of Mayer was that the establishment of a Carmelite house annulled within five miles the faculties of priests for enrolling in the Brown Scapular. Corrigan was upset that this faculty, which he had apparently obtained from Rome for his priests, would be lost with the Carmelites coming to Manhattan. The second item was an excerpt from the material submitted by Moore to *Propaganda Fide*. Ella Edes, who acted as Corrigan's agent in Rome, had informed him by cable in March of the existence of this document. She apparently secured a copy and sent him portions that arrived in New York that day.

Corrigan demanded that Michael Moore retract all of the derogatory material he had given to Rome and also sought from John Bartley that the scapular faculties of his priests would not cease. In time, Moore made the requested retraction in person at *Propaganda Fide*. John Bartley in a document, drawn up in legal terms by Corrigan, allowed the New York priests to retain the faculty of enrolling in the Brown Scapular.

In early April, soon after their arrival, the Carmelites were offering Mass at Saint Stephen's and at the Bellevue Hospital chapel. Edward Southwell had spoken at all the Masses at Saint Stephen's announcing the formation of the new parish due, he said, to the increased population of the area. The boundaries of the parish were to be from 24th to 33rd Streets from the east side of Second Avenue to the East River. That April 14 was Palm Sunday and it marked the first Masses of the new parish of Our Lady of the Scapular. The site was Duke's Tobacco Factory located at First Avenue and 29th Street. This building was multistoried and had a brewery on one of its floors which led to the legend the first Masses in that parish were offered in a brewery.

The temporary church was described as being neat and cheerful. That Easter Sunday, the first Mass was at 5:30 AM with the next at 6:00 and one at each hour until the final one at 11:00 AM. That Sunday also marked the inauguration of Sunday School whose attendance grew within a few years to 500. The construction of the church began that summer. It was forty feet by sixty feet and was basically an iron frame building with a large number of windows. The cost was between \$31,000 and \$33,000 and had to be paid as the work progressed. The land had cost \$70,000 and was secured by a mortgage. Meetings were held to present the immediate financial need of the parish and

it seems that the necessary money was raised as the church was nearing completion that September. Thomas Feehan and John Whitley, who had been working in the American Province, came to New York that summer and joined their Irish brothers.

From the start of that November, 1889 to December 16, a fair was held in the nearly completed church. A spirit of cooperation was manifested by each of the four neighboring parishes who each operated a table at the fair. It was opened by William Grace, the former New York City mayor. The prizes of the fair included paintings, a cane from the Lord Mayor of Dublin and a Dublin drawing room donated by Mrs. Ashman. This latter consisted of furniture plus a ton of coal to feed the room's fireplaces.

December 22 was the dedication of the church with Archbishop Corrigan presiding. Charles Colton, pastor of Saint Stephen's, was the celebrant and Father Patrick Dillon, originally of Dublin but then of Newark, delivered the sermon. Shortly afterwards, Corrigan was affiliated to the Carmelite Order for which he was grateful perhaps indicating the healing of his past grievances with the Carmelites.

Michael Daly was appointed the first pastor of Our Lady of the Scapular and Edward Southwell the first prior of the community. In a short period of time, Daly seemed to fade in stature and Southwell grew to prominence. Perhaps this is the reason Southwell wrote Galli beginning in March, 1890 letters stating his personal dissatisfaction with the religious observance and personal conduct of the Carmelites in his community. This is the beginning of a grand plan of Southwell.

In January, 1891, Edward Southwell refinanced the debt of the parish. \$95,000 was borrowed at 5% plus insurance paper at 3 ½ % for twenty years. This amounted to payments of \$7,200 each year which Southwell thought the parish could manage and still allowed for the construction of a hall desperately needed for parish functions and Sunday School. This was built in 1891 on the original lots facing 28th Street and just west of the church. The site of the hall would later be occupied by a priory. At the Irish provincial chapter of that year, Edward Southwell was reappointed prior of the community.

Sadness came to the community in 1893 with the death of Thomas Feehan that December 5 and in July, 1894 with the death of John Whitley. As was customary in those days, Feehan's remains must have been placed for that winter in a vault as a large plot in Calvary Cemetery in Queens was purchased on the death of Whitley and he and Feehan were the first interred there.

Chapter 2

Expansion

After his reelection as prior of Our Lady of the Scapular at the Irish Provincial Chapter of 1891, Edward Southwell was in control of all facets of both the parish and the Carmelite community. In the years 1894 and 1895, he wrote fairly regularly to his provincial, John Hall, and to the general of the order, Luigi Galli. He reported poor observance in the community without being specific about the conduct he so considered. His accusations fell on one or two individuals and were generally concerned very minute matters of daily living. While Southwell reported this personal conduct, he praised the work in ministry of his Carmelites. In this ambiguous situation, one wonders about the accuracy of Southwell's reporting or what was his motivation in creating this anomaly.

It seems that Edward Southwell kept in fairly close contact with Archbishop Corrigan. We don't know if there were personal visits or that Southwell kept a high profile by being present at ceremonies or ecclesiastical events. After one such contact with Corrigan, Southwell was able to report in 1895 that the archbishop had offered the Carmelites the care of a parish in Tarrytown in Westchester County, just north of New York City.

At the Irish Provincial Chapter in 1895, Thomas Davis was elected the Irish provincial. Michael Daly had been appointed the original pastor of Our Lady of the Scapular in 1889 and Edward Southwell named the prior. Southwell felt that since all work in the parish was parochial, the two offices should not be separated but combined. He brought out this point during the visitation of Michael Moore in 1894 and Moore appointed Southwell to be both prior and pastor but no one told Michael Daly. Thomas Davis, after his election, was set to right this obvious injustice. He ordered the election of a sub prior, treasurer and the appointment of priests to moderate each of the parish societies with the goal of dividing authority and making its possession less in one person, namely Southwell.

In the summer of 1895, Southwell had not yet purchased land or housing for the Tarrytown parish. He confided to Galli his fear that once the parish was established, it would go to some young and undeserving father as pastor. He subtly told the general that there was great opportunity to advance the order in the United States but he felt there had to be a separation from Ireland for this to be accomplished. Hinting just a little bit about his own master plan, Southwell stated that the Carmelites in Englewood, the American Province, felt the same way. In spring of 1896, title to the property Southwell had purchased in Tarrytown was not yet cleared. His plan would have to wait.

Our Lady of the Scapular Parish was a good part of the social life of the community. Each year, there was a celebration of the anniversary of the founding of the parish. Besides Mass, there was an invited preacher. Sometimes there was a procession of parish societies followed by vespers and Benediction. There was, of course, the annual fair and a good number of societies established in the parish which gave the members opportunities for socializing.

In 1897, with a house and property in Tarrytown finally in clear possession, Southwell boldly

unfolded to Luigi Galli his complete plan. Mentioning that he had discussed this matter with Archbishop Martinelli, the Apostolic Delegate to the United States, Southwell asked for the separation of the New York parish and that in Tarrytown and their placement under direct jurisdiction of the general. He, of course, would be the one in charge. He had also discussed this matter with Archbishop Corrigan whom, he claimed, had given the Carmelites the Tarrytown parish so that a novitiate or house of formation be established there.

There was no pastor appointed for the Tarrytown parish which had received the name, Transfiguration. The first Mass had been celebrated in October, 1896 in a room of the Cleveland Mansion as the property was called. Priests from the Manhattan parish commuted for the weekend services and Masses. The property was about four acres in size and had a large residence and some outbuildings on it. On October 24, 1897, Archbishop Corrigan came by train and after a parade style of procession from the railroad station, blessed the cornerstone of the church.

One year later, on October 16, Corrigan returned to preside at the dedication of the completed church. None of the ministry of the Solemn High Mass were Carmelites and Thomas Campbell, SJ, of Fordham University preached. What is noteworthy from his words is the statement that this new facility was to be used for the training of young men for the work of the Carmelite Order in the United States.

Edward Southwell continued his letter writing about the separation of his two houses to the direct authority of the Carmelite general. He laid out his plan to Archbishops Martinelli and Corrigan and both of them wrote to the general, Luigi Galli. Despite all that was written, Luigi Galli passed the buck in a classic fashion. He left the entire matter to the 1899 Irish Provincial Chapter.

The chapter was composed of only the franchised voters and they elected Andrew Farrington as provincial. Letters to Rome from members of the Irish Province began almost simultaneously to the election of Farrington who was quite exact in the observance of regulations and presence at religious exercises. Luigi Galli died in 1901 and Simon Bernardini was elected by the other Roman officials of the order to serve as General. He appointed Richard Colfer to be his visitor of the Irish Province. After Colfer sent his report to Bernardini in Rome, Farrington was removed from office and Colfer was appointed to finish his term. Bernardini convoked a general chapter of the order in 1902 and though he had been controlling the order, Pius Mayer of the American Province was elected Prior General.

Edward Southwell wasted no time in getting in touch with the new general. He told him he intended to keep control of Tarrytown because he feared a young priest would gain charge of it and make the place a Sunday rendezvous for young New Yorkers and not a college and novitiate. He mentioned that Anastatius Kreidt of the American Province would be of assistance. Southwell was rather close to Kreidt and the Carmelites in Englewood. There are allusions to Englewood and perhaps another house of that province joining Southwell in his separation scheme. The Carmelites of Englewood came regularly to Transfiguration in Tarrytown to offer Mass and administer sacraments.

Tarrytown and the 28th Street parish were so linked by Southwell that the debt of Tarrytown

was considered that of the Manhattan parish and met by it. After the visitation of New York by Richard Colfer in 1902, a meeting of himself as vicar provincial with his advisors took place in Dublin. Our Lady of the Scapular and Transfiguration were made separate and distinct houses. The debt of Tarrytown was reduced by part of it being given to 28th Street. Because of the incongruity of one pastor for two parishes so far apart, Simon Michael O'Byrne was made the pastor of Tarrytown and was the first pastor officially appointed. He was a good choice as he had ministered to the Sisters of Mercy at their Tarrytown orphanage in the years before the Carmelites came there. As would be expected, Edward Southwell was not at all pleased with this outcome.

In March, 1903, Romaeus Edward Stone died of pneumonia. His service at the parish and Bellevue Hospital were known and admired. Archbishop Farley presided at the funeral Mass. Thirty-five priests were present as well as a large number of laity. Over one hundred carriages were required for the procession to Calvary Cemetery.

At this time, the schedule of services offered at Our Lady of the Scapular was quite impressive. Sunday Masses "with short exhortation" were at 5:30, 6:00, 7:00, 8:00, 9:00 (children's Mass), 10:00, 11:00 (High Mass with sermon). Sunday evenings had vespers, sermon and benediction at 7:30. With the omission of the 11:00 AM Mass, the holyday schedule was the same and those evenings had Rosary, sermon and benediction at 8:00. Weekday Masses were at 6:00, 7:00, 8:00 and 9:00 with an additional 5:30 AM on First Fridays. Confessions were heard 4:00 to 6:00 and 7:00 to 10:00 every Friday and Saturday evening and the eves of holydays and First Fridays. They were also available whenever the church was open by ringing the "Confession Bell."

In those days when little or none of the entertainment we experience today was available to people, the vibrancy of the life of a parish was judged by the number of societies in the parish. This being so, the life of Our Lady of the Scapular was indeed vibrant. Societies were: Scapular Confraternity, Catholic Benevolent League (an insurance organization), Sacred Heart Society, Saint Joseph Society (for outings, exercise and athletics of the young men), Saint Ann's Society (married women), Children of Mary as well as a junior branch, Holy Angels Sodality, Young Ladies Carmelite Sodality which also had a junior branch, Saint Vincent De Paul Society (one each in the parish and Bellevue). The following organizations, more than parish wide, were associated: the Knights of Columbus (Vera Cruz Council), the Ancient Order of Hibernians and the 69th Regiment.

With a provincial chapter scheduled for 1903, Edward Southwell made preparations to achieve his goals. He secured letters from Archbishop John Farley and Charles Colton, pastor of Saint Stephen's and soon to be named Bishop of Buffalo. Each one was addressed for presentation to the chapter and advocated a novitiate or house of formation for the Irish Carmelites in the United States as well as the eventual separation of the New York houses from Irish jurisdiction. Stanislaus Bartley was elected provincial at the chapter. As far as the proposals of Southwell went, a decree was made that the Irish Carmelites in both Australia and the United States could accept prospects for the order and send them to Dublin's Terenure College for their education.

The railroad that was later known as the Putnam Division of the New York Central was being constructed around 1900. It began at the Polo Grounds in Manhattan and went north through

Westchester County to Brewster in Putnam County following a route between those of the Hudson and Harlem divisions of the Central. Elmsford, Located a little over a mile east of Tarrytown, was one of the stops on the new line. There were tracts of vacant land there and developers moved in to survey and divide parcels. The purchasers were Italian or Irish immigrants who worked on the new rail line. To serve these people, the Tarrytown Carmelites purchased a lot in July, 1904 for the site of a church. By that October, the church structure was well advanced and was used for worship in February, 1905.

Edward Southwell wrote Archbishop Farley in May, 1904 to say that the financial condition of Our Lady of the Scapular parish allowed for the construction of a school. Apparently, there was encouragement from Farley. Southwell told the archbishop the cost of the school would be \$60,000 and land costs would be only \$28,000. The construction would cause the rise of the parish debt to \$154,000 but Southwell felt this could be handled because \$110,000 had been paid off parish debt since 1889.

The school construction began in the summer and continued into the fall of 1904 with the cornerstone being blessed that November. The building was completed and dedicated by Archbishop Farley on September 24, 1905. Auxiliary Bishop Thomas Cusack gave the main address. The enrollment that first year was 700. Southwell had seen the school as being absolutely necessary for the parish. It helped the parishioners and especially the children to be more closely associated with their parish and the Carmelites. Especially was this true of the extracurricular activities of the children.

Earlier that fall, there had been a visitation of the two houses by the provincial, Stanislaus Bartley. He asked that observance be more regular but had no major problems to deal with. Edward Southwell did much good in his time in New York building up of the Manhattan parish and beginning the Tarrytown parish. His personal life was one to be admired. He had good relations with those ecclesiastics in authority and the people he served. He traveled and seemed to have the creature comforts he desired. His constant letter writing to those in charge was perhaps motivated by a personal scruple or his regard for authority with too much seriousness.

Pius Mayer, the Prior General, visited the New York houses in March, 1906 in preparation for the Irish Provincial Chapter which began that May 7. Michael A. O'Reilly was elected provincial and Louis McCabe was elected to replace Edward Southwell in New York. That summer, Southwell returned to New York to collect his possessions. While there, he was given a large and cordial farewell. He remained until that September when he returned to Ireland and his new domicile at Whitefriars Street, Dublin.

Chapter 3

Further Growth

Louis McCabe's first fair at Our Lady of the Scapular was called the Shamrock Fair. It was named after the successive yachts Sir Thomas Lipton employed in attempts to win America's Cup. McCabe had met Lipton on a trans Atlantic trip and McCabe prevailed upon Lipton to head a collection for a woman passenger who gave birth on board to her sixth child and then learned her husband had died in Colorado. The solicitation was successful. Sir Thomas was at the fair for the "opening night" which it was called though it was actually the closing night. The mayor of Boston, John Fitzgerald, known as "Honey Fitz," was also present that evening. The wife of President Theodore Roosevelt sent a picture of the White House as a prize. The debt of the parish is variously listed but it seems to have been around \$165,000 and McCabe saw its reduction as his primary task. Besides the usual fairs, he continued the annual Parish Reunion and introduced other fund raisers.

A high point of McCabe's pastorate was the visit in 1908 of Michael Cardinal Logue, the primate of all Ireland, to the Carmelite church. The cardinal was on a tour of the United States and came on May 10 to Our Lady of the Scapular for a visit and vespers. Reports of the time cited a large crowd of people and 200 young men of the parish recruited to assist the police in maintaining order.

Though he was stationed in Ireland for McCabe's tenure as pastor, Edward Southwell was still writing letters to advance his scheme of a separate jurisdiction. He made vague references to a house or two of the American Province that might be cajoled into joining his plan. Whether they had any connection with his plan or not, we do not know. He was offered the position of Pro Provincial for Australia but after much soul searching or hesitation, he either turned it down or another was appointed.

Louis McCabe in sending stipends to Pius Mayer was almost bragging at the end of 1908 that he had paid off \$52,000 of the parish debt in just two years. If he had ulterior motives, they were crushed for at the 1909 Irish Province chapter Edward Southwell was elected provincial. Paul O'Dwyer was made pastor and prior at Our Lady of the Scapular while McCabe was sent to Australia. The chapter decreed that a novitiate should be established in Tarrytown as soon as possible. Denis O'Connor became the prior and pastor at Transfiguration.

Mother Butler and her Religious of the Sacred Heart of Mary became established in 1903 in Tarrytown at the Reynard estate on the hills overlooking the village and Transfiguration Church. From the beginning, the Carmelites were chaplains to the sisters and their schools. The proudest boast one winter was that the horse and carriage made it up the hill every morning. The Institute of Mercy, run by the Sisters of Mercy, had come in 1894 to the Tarrytown hills on land bordering the Rockefeller Estate. Before the Carmelites became established in Tarrytown, Simon O'Byrne ministered to the sisters and their charges, a work continued by the Fathers until the sisters moved to

Dobbs Ferry.

Paul O'Dwyer converted the hall adjoining the west side of the Church of Our Lady of the Scapular into a gymnasium with physical fitness equipment and games and established the Carmelite Athletic Association. This was similar to a boys' club and offered a site for recreation other than the streets. This large hall had been used for Sunday School and parish meetings. The completion of the school afforded facilities for these activities.

In 1910, O'Dwyer was able to entertain Vincenzo Cardinal Vannutelli who was returning to Europe from the Eucharistic congress in Montreal. He and Richard Colfer had met the cardinal when they attended the Eucharistic Congress. He accepted their invitation to visit Our Lady of the Scapular and he was tendered a luncheon when he fulfilled his promise. That same year, O'Dwyer reported to Prior General Mayer that he had paid off \$30,000 of the parish debt. In that same letter, he groused about Southwell's visit because he was picky so about minor matters.

In the fall of 1910, Edward Southwell wrote Pius Mayer in Rome of the offer to the Carmelites of another parish, Otisville, NY, which included the care of a tuberculosis sanitarium run by New York City and associated with Bellevue Hospital. Otisville was being cared for by Saint Joseph's in Wurtsboro where Lawrence Flanagan, then stationed in Tarrytown, was doing two Masses each weekend. Southwell was enthused about the offer because he saw the possibility of a novitiate being located there rather than at Tarrytown. He saw the latter as being too close to the entertainment and recreational opportunities of the metropolitan area.

Lawrence Flanagan began serving at Otisville in 1910. Archbishop Farley wanted a rectory built there and gave \$500 towards it but Flanagan boarded at a cottage near the church. He built a dance pavilion for use in the good weather and after purchasing land erected Lyceum Hall for social events and for meetings. Flanagan, using a large metal scoop and a team of horses, dug the hall's foundation himself. The parish at Otisville presented a complex situation as the title belonged to Saint Joseph's of Middletown but had been served by the Wurtsboro parish. The property was transferred to the Otisville church under its title of Holy Name, incorporated in 1893.

Around the time that the Carmelites undertook to serve the Otisville church, they began to offer Mass at Bloomingburg. A long time parishioner placed the date at 1912 but was not sure. An old photo from that time depicts Bishop Cusack with Hugh Devlin and Richard Colfer. The church seems to have been begun in 1912 and dedicated the following year. That 1913 was the year that Colfer transferred the church's property to the parish. Transportation of the priest to Bloomingburg was on the morning milk train which was met by a parishioner.

His visitation of his New York houses made Southwell realize that finances were his largest problem as provincial. Especially was this manifested in student maintenance and education particularly if there were any students from the United States. At the time he wrote this to Mayer, Southwell was taking the place of Denis O'Connor in Tarrytown and was going to use the money earned by this supply for the student fund. He suggested to the general that he allow his assistant, Peter Elias Magennis, to come to the United States and do parish missions for this same purpose. Mayer was favorable to this idea.

The parish of Saint Paul's in Bullville had been in existence since 1865 being serve over the years by various parishes. In 1901 or 1902, Saint Joseph's in Wurtsboro began to care for it and this lasted until 1911 when the Carmelites began ministry there. Michael Simon Farrington went there in 1912 and served the parish until 1940 except for some periods of time when he worked in Bellevue Hospital.

The area of Our Lady of Mount Carmel in Elmsford, which was a mission of Transfiguration in Tarrytown, had grown in population and Archbishop Farley wanted to make it an independent parish. He did not want the Carmelites to staff two neighboring parishes and was inclined to appoint an archdiocesan priest as the pastor. At the same time, the living conditions of those staffing Otisville, Bloomingburg and Bullville were not ideal. It seems that Farrington traveled from Tarrytown to serve Bloomingburg and priests may have come from New York for Bullville. Edward Southwell discussed this with Farley and suggested that the Carmelites be given a parish in Middletown from where the priests could travel to these missions. Farley told Southwell to survey the area and report back.

Southwell reported that Middletown had a population of 20,000 but only 4,000 to 5,000 were Catholics. It was divided by the Erie Railroad into a hilly residential area that housed the wealthy and also Saint Joseph's Church. The other was a "business and industrial" section. Southwell asked to have a parish in this latter area. In 1912, Elmsford was removed from Carmelite care and in that same year a residence was purchased in Middletown and it became the center of Carmelite work in Orange County.

The property purchased was that of Dr. Samuel Shorter and besides a residence had a large barn dating to a previous owner who had operated a grist mill. This was converted into a chapel and an early, if not the first use of it, was for Christmas, 1912. Peter Elias Magennis was in town and preached at the 10:00 AM Mass that Christmas Day. Richard Colfer was the pastor until 1919 when Louis McCabe replaced him. Land on West Main Street for a church was bought in 1919 but construction did not begin until 1924 when Dominic Hastings was pastor. The structure, named Our Lady of Mount Carmel, was a basement church with a large entrance with bell tower fronting West Main Street.

Once settled in Middletown, the Carmelites continued to serve the Otisville parish as well as the sanitarium. New York City donated a piece of the institution's grounds for a Catholic chapel. With permission from Cardinal Farley, Richard Colfer was able to raise locally the money needed for its construction. The city also appointed him the chaplain with the salary of \$250 a year. At the suggestion of Farley, Colfer visited what was then called the Hampton Reformatory. He instituted Sunday Mass, other services and religious instructions. Colfer was appointed the first chaplain and must have been a rather busy priest. In 1914-5, he went once a week to Unionville to prepare children for First Communion. For that ceremony, they came by train to Middletown. Rail transportation of Catholics in that area to either Sussex, New Jersey or to Middletown was the normal way of attending Mass until 1948 when a Protestant church in Unionville was purchased as a mission of the Middletown parish and used for Mass every Sunday.

The home of Joseph Kurpick in South Centerville was the site for Masses by Peter Elias O'Dwyer. He seems to have served the area for a number of years. In the spring of 1916, the building of a church was begun in South Centerville on a piece of land the O'Brien family donated from their farm. Richard Colfer offered the first Mass in the structure in the fall of 1917. Later, when a larger church was called for, it was built near the Minisink Valley High School. The original church was moved to the new site and used as a hall. The land that the original church was on reverted to the O'Briens.

Mount Carmel Parish in Middletown, its mission churches and institutions served, covered a vast area. Some claimed it was the largest parish in area in the Archdiocese of New York. Some of the missions were summer vacation areas and the number of priests required for Masses had the various pastors importing Passionists from Hoboken and Jesuits from a number of houses for assistance.

In 1910, while Denis O'Connor was the pastor of Transfiguration in Tarrytown, he was accused by the pastors of neighboring Saint Theresa's in North Tarrytown and Immaculate Conception in Irvington of violating parish boundaries. In those days, boundaries were a serious matter and Michael Lavelle, the rector of Saint Patrick's Cathedral was sent to settle the dispute.

Chapter 4

Life in Manhattan

As the 1910 Fair at Our Lady of the Scapular approached, much was made of the parish debt being over \$100,000. The presence of Cardinal Logue of Ireland to open the Fair also brought in attendance Archbishop Farley and Bishop Cusack. The Carmelite Church and School Debt Paying Association was formed of parishioners who canvassed the parish seeking contributions for the debt reduction. Lists indicate donations of twenty-five cents to \$1.50.

The feast of Our Lady of Mount Carmel, July 16, was celebrated with great solemnity in this period. Preceded by a novena, the feast had a prominent preacher at both the Main Mass and an evening service.

At the 1911 Fair, chances were sold on a 1912 Flanders automobile. As the draw drum was being turned on the last night of the fair, Father Paul O'Dwyer was called to the door of the auditorium and handed a letter. This contained threats of dire consequences if the raffle took place. The letter was from Anthony Comstock, the president of the Society for the Suppression of Vice. O'Dwyer cancelled the draw and offered to return the chance money to anyone who requested it. It is reported that no one did but the net from the Fair was \$3,000 less than the previous year.

In February, 1911, Edward Southwell, the Irish Provincial, came to the United States with Hugh Devlin and were met at the boat by Peter Elias Magennis who brought them to Tarrytown where Denis O'Connor was the pastor. Southwell, Devlin and Magennis were to preach parish missions from that time into the spring. The schedule was rather rigorous with at least two sermons a day and numerous confessions. Southwell was very blunt about the purpose of such. He intended the money earned to be brought back to Ireland to reduce the province's debts. The return that year was 600 Sterling of which Southwell was very proud.

According to diaries and other records, Magennis, assisted by priests coming from Ireland conducted these missions for a number of years. The season was about four months. Though the length of a mission in a parish usually was for a week, one in Philadelphia endured for a month. Besides bringing in money for the province's debts, the missions made the name of the Carmelites, as well as the names of those giving them, more widely known. Later, Magennis was able to draw support from priests he met in this way for his promotion of the Irish cause.

Paul O'Dwyer did not pay the full salaries of the Carmelites at Our Lady of the Scapular. Whether he began this practice or just continued what had been done in the past is not evident. Edward Southwell claimed this resulted in the Carmelites being owed \$65,000 by the parish. At a November, 1911 meeting with his definitory, Southwell made a number of regulations. The Carmelites and the parish were to have separate accounts. The salaries owed the Carmelites were to be paid gradually until the money owed was satisfied. O'Dwyer appealed to Pius Mayer, the prior

general, against these rulings. Much to the chagrin of Southwell, Mayer supported O'Dwyer. Southwell used every occasion he could to tell of this injustice of O'Dwyer and to accuse him of improper book keeping.

1914 marked the twenty-fifth anniversary of the parish. Previous to the event, Cardinal Farley permitted the Carmelites to make a financial appeal throughout the archdiocese. He granted this favor because he noted that the Carmelites, taking care of the poor in Bellevue Hospital and the Irish throughout the city, gave them the aura of a national parish. There are no records of the success of this appeal. The anniversary Mass was on September 13 with Archbishop Giovanni Bonzano, the Apostolic Delegate to the United States, presiding. Bishop Charles Colton of Buffalo was the celebrant while Bishop Thomas Cusack, auxiliary of New York, preached. The delegate also presided at the vespers and benediction on that evening.

An Irish Provincial Chapter was scheduled for Easter Week of 1912 but at what appeared to be the insistence of Edward Southwell, it was postponed to July of 1913. The Carmelite Curia in Rome apparently asked for opinions particularly from those who had the right to be in attendance at the chapter. Some wanted appointments to be made in place of elections. Some decried the party politics of those in power shown in appointing their friends to offices.

Having received the information they sought, the curia in 1913 made the following appointments: John Cogan as provincial, Edward Southwell as prior of 28th Street, Denis O'Connor of Tarrytown and Richard Colfer of Middletown. The positions of O'Connor and Colfer were simply extended but Southwell's was new so he immediately left Ireland for New York.

1915 marked the fiftieth anniversary of the ordination of Edward Southwell. A Solemn High Mass was held at Our Lady of the Scapular with Peter Elias Magennis preaching. It was indeed a memorable day as Southwell was one of the founding fathers and was a link to the beginning of the Carmelites in New York.

It was rumored that Peter Elias Magennis had resigned as assistant general of the order. When his provincial, John Cogan, heard this, he asked John Lorenzoni, the Prior General, if this were true. It was denied but apparently Magennis did submit his resignation and when it was not accepted, he appealed to the Congregation for Religious. The appeal was returned to Lorenzoni who sought to have Magennis come to Rome for a discussion. Magennis felt the two months he had off that year between missions was not long enough for a trip to Rome.

As a result of his visitations of the Irish-American and Australian priories, Magennis felt it was time in both places to have houses for those seeking to join the order and also for novices. The Irish chapter of 1909 had ordered the establishment of novitiates but nothing had been done. In 1914, there appears to have been some fund raising for such a house as Cardinal Farley gave a donation of \$500.

1916 was set for a chapter of the Irish Province though John Cogan, the provincial, sought to postpone it. The danger of travel from Australia and America by ship during World War I was partly responsible for this. The chapter did take place that July in a Dublin occupied by British troops in the wake of the Easter Rising. Peter Elias Magennis presided and John Cogan was reelected

provincial. The contributions of the three New York houses to the novitiate amounted to 3,000 Sterling but the period of time was not stated. Richard Colfer was appointed to remain in Middletown, Denis O'Connor was made prior of New York and Edward Southwell replaced him in Tarrytown. The main discussion at the chapter was a formation facility in the United States. Tarrytown was thought to be the ideal location but money and manpower were the two main obstacles.

Before the Italian parish of Sacred Hearts was opened on 33rd Street just a block north of the boundary of Our Lady of the Scapular, Monsignor Lavelle, Vicar General, sounded out the Carmelites. They responded that while they were not in favor of curtailing anything helpful to the Italians, their congregation had to be affected by the close presence of another church. Just two years later the Carmelites were distressed to read that another Italian parish, Saint Sebastian, was to be established on 24th Street, the southern end of their parish. When Edward Southwell protested this to Cardinal Farley, he was more or less told that the decision had been made and would not be revoked. Farley ignored the point of Southwell's protest and told him that the Carmelites would be given another parish in the northern part of the city when the opportunity presented itself.

In Tarrytown, Edward Southwell marked the twentieth anniversary of Transfiguration Church with a debt reduction scheme. In a letter to parishioners, he appealed for contributions to reduce this encumbrance of \$20,000 with \$2,000 to be paid each year.

Saint Albert's, Middletown, opened in September, 1917 as a preparatory seminary, a formation and educational institution to prepare students to enter the novitiate in Ireland and pursue subsequent college work. The original purchase involved "The Thistles" and surrounding land. The sale was completed in time for a September opening when five or six students were in attendance. There was only one Carmelite in residence, Robert Albert Metcalf, who named the school Saint Albert's, after the patron of his name in religion, Saint Albert. Richard Colfer would walk each day from Mount Carmel Parish to teach class. Besides the problems of a new institution, Saint Albert's had the grim shadow of the draft of young men for World War I hanging over it. Among the first students were John Maher and John Hickey who would become the first ordained Americans of the New York Commissariate. Not far behind them was William Daly who would follow the other two to Ireland in 1921 for the next stage of formation of those days.

The numerous missions he gave as well as the dangers of wartime crossing of the Atlantic kept Peter Elias Magennis in the American houses for all of 1917 and 1918 but in 1919 only up to August 19 when he left for Ireland and its provincial chapter. John Cogan was reelected provincial and Gerard O'Farrell was made the pastor in Manhattan. Denis O'Connor and Edward Southwell remained as priors in Our Lady of the Scapular and Transfiguration, Tarrytown.

In the summer of 1921, Peter Elias Magennis made an official visitation of the American houses. Though he made no reports of serious abuses, he laid down a good number of rather rigorous regulations with rather severe penalties for their non observance.

Edward Southwell died in Tarrytown on May 10, 1922 at the age of eighty-two. He was one of the 1889 pioneers and served in either Manhattan or Tarrytown until his death save for 1906-13

which he spent in Ireland. John Cardinal Farley presided at his funeral at Our Lady of the Scapular. Denis O'Connor was the celebrant and Monsignor Livingston, pastor of Saint Gabriel's, the Carmelites northern neighbor, preached while Farley did the final absolution. With the passing of Edward Southwell, the curtain was drawn on the start of Carmel in New York.

Chapter 5

The Irish Freedom Movement

We have already seen that John Cardinal Farley allowed the New York Carmelites to make a city wide collection in 1914 for the twenty-fifth anniversary of their coming to New York. He did this because, as he stated, the Carmelites' parish at Our Lady of the Scapular had the trappings of a Irish national parish.

The Easter Rising of 1916 was an Irish attempt to overthrow British rule. Shortly afterwards, Denis O'Connor was in Ireland for his holidays and the Irish Provincial Chapter. What he saw of British revenge for the Rising, the scarcity of food and the punishment of the people changed him. Though there is no proof of this, I feel that all this caused him to become, while in Ireland, a member of the Irish Republican Brotherhood whose counterpart was the Clan na Gael in the United States. This was a secret and clandestine organization whose members were totally devoted to attaining the freedom of Ireland. Certainly, from 1916 onwards, O'Connor's actions were indicative of such membership.

When Ireland was under the British Crown, the Carmelites were anti-royalists; at the time of the treaty, they were anti treaty; in the Commonwealth era, they were for independence; once the republic was established, they were for the union of all Ireland, north and south. By attributing these positions to the Carmelites, it means that these were the stance of those in charge. The superiors had the opportunity to be free to speak to various groups and to present their position. Since many times, it was the only one presented, it was taken as the Carmelite position.

During the 1916 Easter Rising, Robert Albert Metcalf was the unofficial chaplain for the rebels holed up in Jacobs Biscuit factory and Louis McCabe assisted him in this ministry. Denis O'Connor, McCabe, Metcalf and Peter Elias Magennis, all spoke to Irish groups in New York City of what they had seen or learned from their time in Ireland.

When Donal O'Callaghan was a graduate student, he planned to do his thesis on the Carmelite involvement in the Irish Freedom Movement. He prepared a series of questions, which in the 1940's, he asked of the older Irish born Carmelites. As a result, he was able to say that Peter Elias Magennis was a member of the Clan na Gael and that the Carmelite, Hugh Devlin, carried messages to the United States for the Clan. Magennis and Christopher Slattery also were couriers for the Republicans. During World War I, the 28th Street priory's phones were tapped by the federal government and Magennis was under government surveillance.

During the period of Denis O'Connor's pastorate, 1916-1924, the Irish activity at the Carmelite parish was at its height. O'Connor and Peter Elias Magennis were very close friends. They had originally met at the Carmelites' Dublin school, Terenure College, and had served together in Australia. O'Connor encouraged Irish activities in the parish by making his school auditorium available to any and all Irish groups requesting its use. In the school children's curriculum were Irish music and dance as well as Irish history and culture. The same classes were available after school

hours for adults.

In his years at the 28th Street parish, Gerard O'Farrell regretted that his work in the parish and Bellevue Hospital prevented him from doing more for the Irish cause. His interest was Irish literature, music and art. He gave a number of lectures in these areas and authored a small book on Patrick Pearse, the first president of the Irish Republic.

Lawrence D. Flanagan was stationed at Our Lady of Mount Carmel in Middletown and its mission parishes until he came to the Manhattan parish in 1924. He was a tall man of serious mien whose role among the Irish was that of a trusted advisor. Besides his birth in Westmeath, Ireland, his connection to the Irish Freedom Movement was rooted in his long and close friendship with Eamon De Valera, his fellow student at Dublin's Blackrock College.

The Carmelite priory was open to Irish Republicans. One example of this hospitality was Liam Mellows. He had participated in the Easter Rising and had escaped to the United States in 1916. He stayed for periods of time at the Carmelite Priory and taught Irish music and dance in the parish school. When he contracted the flu, he recuperated at Saint Albert's in Middletown where he also spent some vacation time. He had returned to Ireland in 1920 and was captured among the anti-treatyites at the Four Courts in 1922. Imprisoned at Kilmainham, he was executed December 8, 1922 by the Cosgrave government in retaliation for the killing of a Free State officer. Peter Elias Magennis tried to see him before his death, but was denied. Afterwards, he spoke out strongly against this injustice meted out to his friend.

Sean T. O'Kelly, later the president of Ireland, told of how he had come to America in September, 1924, to represent the Republican Party and how he was warmly received at the Carmelite Priory. Harry Boland stayed there a number of times and recovered for two weeks at the priory when he contracted the flu. When Eamon De Valera escaped from prison in England in 1919, he came secretly to the United States and stayed at the priory. It was from the priory that he came for his first appearance in the United States on June 23, 1919 at the Waldorf Astoria Hotel.

The Friends of Irish Freedom (FOIF), an organization aimed at the support of the Irish cause, began in June, 1916. From the very beginning, Carmelites spoke to the different Branches established throughout the city. Surprisingly, it was not until June, 1917 that a Branch was begun at the Carmelite parish. The Carmelite Branch grew to be the largest and the most active of any of the New York Branches because it concentrated on Irish cultural and intellectual aspects as well as entertainment.

When a split developed between Eamon De Valera and both Judge Daniel F. Cohalan and John Devoy, the American Association for the Recognition of the Irish Republic (AARIR) was begun and wholeheartedly supported by the Carmelite parish. Their Republicanism and support of De Valera prompted them to do this. Denis O'Connor became an officer of the AARIR in New York State.

The Irish Progressive League was formed as a result of New York City's harassment of the street preachers whose main message was to stay out of World War I and not support England in this venture. Some enemies described it in these words, "This league was a radical organization with

some distinctly dubious members.” When the Cohalan faction gained control of the FOIF, the Irish Progressive League was expelled from “associate society membership.” Liam Mellows was an active member but John Devoy would not support the group. Patrick McCartan, who was present at many of the groups’ gatherings, openly stated that the Carmelites were behind the League’s activities. He told how Magennis was usually the chairman of the police supervised meetings of the League. At a January, 1919 meeting, Norman Thomas, the perennial socialist candidate for president, was the main speaker.

The Irish Progressive League sponsored a rally at Madison Square Garden to protest the British conscription of the Irish because they would then be forced to fight for England, their oppressor who deprived them of their human rights. Before the rally took place on May 4, 1918, Mrs. William Jay and others tried to stop the gathering. She was unsuccessful. Peter Elias Magennis presided and among others spoke harshly and critically of England and her efforts to drag the United States into the war. The next day protests were made to John Cardinal Farley for Magennis’ role. After a drawn out exchange of letters, the result was that Magennis was prohibited from presiding at such events in the future. The Irish rushed to the his defense and to the condemnation of Farley.

On the 18th of that same month, Magennis was elected the national president of the Friends of Irish Freedom at the Second Irish Race Convention. During his term of office, he used the network of clergy he had created through his parish missions to found new Branches and attached them to parishes and increased the group’s membership. At the Third Irish Race Convention in February, 1919, Magennis was reelected president but had to resign when he was elected the Carmelites’ prior general later that year.

The election of Magennis as general furnished him the opportunity to serve the Irish Freedom Movement in another role. Sean T. O’Kelly had resigned his post in Paris as the representative of the Provisional Government of the Irish Republic and came to Rome for a vacation. While there he was pressed into service because it was rumored that the Vatican was about to condemn the warfare tactics of the Republicans during the Irish Civil War. Peter Elias Magennis and John Hagen, rector of the Irish College, prepared O’Kelly for his presentation to Pope Benedict XV. These efforts were successful as the condemnation was never issued.

It is no wonder that Eamon De Valera referred to the Carmelites’ Manhattan parish of Our Lady of the Scapular as that “Cradle in America of Irish Independence.”

Chapter 6

To a Commissary

John Cardinal Farley had promised the Carmelites a parish in a developing section of New York City. It was seemingly conditioned on the establishment of a formation house for candidates to the order. Saint Albert's, Middletown, NY, was opened as such a house in 1917 but the promise had not been fulfilled when Farley died in 1918. John Cogan, the Irish provincial, visited Farley's successor, Patrick Hayes, who fulfilled the promise. He gave a parish in the Bronx which was developing after the completion of the Grand Concourse in 1909 making the area easily accessible. Gerard O'Farrell was named as pastor of the new parish at the Irish Chapter of 1919. While he was still living at the Manhattan parish, O'Farrell would travel to the Bronx each day and visit the people living in the area of his new parish.

Gerard O'Farrell bought a large two storey house on a large section of land at 182nd Street and Valentine Avenue, just two short blocks east of the Grand Concourse. On March 28, 1920 the first Mass in the parish was celebrated in this house. Construction of the church began shortly afterwards and because Cardinal Hayes would not attend cornerstone ceremonies, O'Farrell completed the church save for the cornerstone. He then asked Hayes to dedicate the church and O'Farrell included the laying of the cornerstone as part of the ceremony. The church was built as a basement with the intention of adding an upper structure as the parish grew. A priory was the next building erected and ground was broken in 1925 for the parish school to which would be later added a coed parish high school.

At the 1922 Irish Province chapter, John Cogan was elected provincial for a fourth term. At that chapter, Peter Elias Magennis appointed Denis O'Connor "Procurator Provincial" as the first step in establishing a new province of the order for the New York houses. When a petition was presented to the Holy See in 1923 for a "Commissary General" of these houses, the response was that such was not needed as the actions at the chapter on September 7, 1922 had already established the New York houses as a separate ecclesiastical jurisdiction. Shortly after this, a novitiate was established at Saint Albert's, Middletown, in the newly purchased Grey House.

On March 1, 1924, Denis O'Connor died at the age of fifty-two at New York's Saint Vincent's Hospital. The cause of his death was given as septic pneumonia and heart failure. He had apparently been in the hospital for a week or so. His loss was a great setback to the fledgling group of Carmelites and the Irish Freedom Movement lost a leader who would never be replaced.

Gerard O'Farrell was named Commissary General on November 3, 1924 and in his stead, Elias Vella, from the Maltese Province, was named pastor of Saint Simon Stock. O'Farrell's first year as the major superior saw the purchase of the Maybe parcel of land at Saint Albert's with the intention of using it for a cemetery. The Saint Simon Stock priory and school were both finished that year and Our Lady of Mount Carmel church in Middletown was completed and ready for dedication.

Before the construction of the Saint Simon Stock priory, the original two story house that had served as church and priory in the early days of the parish was sold. The new owner moved the house to Ryer Avenue and turned it into a two family house. During the construction stage of the church and priory, the fathers lived in rented quarters at 2212 Valentine Avenue.

The lack of personnel brought about the service of four novice masters during the 1923-5 period. There was an increase in vocation prospects and with the novitiate having been established in 1924, there was a facility to care for them. Brocard Whalen had been a Christian Brother for some twenty years and had completed the Carmelite novitiate. John Galvin had studied theology in Ireland and also had made his profession. In regard to studies, they were both prepared but they had not made their solemn profession and so had no title for ordination. Both had completed their studies with the Carmelites in Chicago and after much correspondence, they were temporarily adopted by Bishop O'Brien of Petersburg, Canada. Auxiliary Bishop John Dunn of New York was helpful in the entire matter. Whalen was ordained in Chicago March 29, 1926 and Galvin in New York on March 28 and have the distinction of being the first two ordained for the new commissariate and also that of being ordained previous to solemn vows.

There was a Volunteer Chaplain Service of priests, organized by a Monsignor Brady, that worked at Bellevue Hospital. Some difficulty developed between them and the Carmelite chaplains. Gerard O'Farrell had to compose a report on the Carmelites' hospital work for the chancery office. Because he felt he had to explain this report, O'Farrell delivered it in person. His main thrust was that the Volunteer Chaplain Service annoyed the hospital staff by keeping irregular hours and doing for a second time the work that the Carmelites had already done. He suggested that the Service work under the direction of Lawrence Flanagan, the pastor of the 28th Street parish. O'Farrell stated his desire to follow the wishes of Cardinal Hayes and this seems to have been the end of the matter.

The 1925 General Chapter of the order replaced Francis Ronayne as the assistant general for the English speaking provinces with Hilary Doswald from Chicago's Most Pure Heart of Mary Province. O'Farrell was at the chapter and returned home to face rather pedestrian work. The brother of a patient at Middletown State Hospital complained that he had no opportunity for confession for some time. O'Farrell replied that the patient turned down confession because he wanted to leave it until death was closer. He also reminded the chancery office that the patients at the State Hospital were there because they were not normal.

Through two instances, O'Farrell assisted the Carmelite sisters at their Florence monastery, which was that of Saint Mary Magdalen Di Pazzi. He bought vestments for a little over \$4,000 from a New York dealer whom the sisters had chosen to be their agent and he gave the convent a large donation. He also met with the sisters at Marymount in Tarrytown and was able to double the stipend they gave the Carmelites for being their chaplains. O'Farrell also visited each of his houses once a week and in view of this, did not feel he had to make a formal visitation. He was very popular in the Bronx parish and had good relations with the Jesuits at Fordham where he visited often. In 1926, O'Farrell was not well due to the presence of kidney stones which were immobilizing these organs' full operation.

Because he wanted to make the dedication of Saint Simon Stock's school and priory a grand affair with Patrick Cardinal Hayes doing the honors, O'Farrell postponed his needed surgery. The dedication was on May 11, followed by a formal dinner. Shortly after this, O'Farrell entered the hospital for his operation. After the surgery, he lingered for a while but died on June 15, 1926. Bishop John Dunn was the celebrant of his funeral at Saint Simon Stock and Hugh Devlin preached over his old friend.

Francis Ronayne was sent from Rome to conduct the process for choosing O'Farrell's successor. Ronayne found time to attend the reception of Archbishop Mannix of Australia at City Hall and the luncheon given him by Lawrence Flanagan at Saint Simon Stock, where Flanagan as the temporary Commissary General was residing. Ronayne sent out blanks for a straw vote before any meeting would take place. Records indicate constant changes in the date and venue of this meeting. Robert Power, then in Australia, and Lawrence Flanagan each had six consultative votes. Despite the tie, Peter Elias Magennis appointed Lawrence Flanagan the Commissary General that September 3 and formal announcement of this was made by the consultors of the commissary on November 22, 1926. A new era had begun.

Chapter 7

The Flanagan Years

Lawrence Dionysius Flanagan, Commissary General for 1926-31 and then provincial for the period 1931-43, was a large influence among the New York Carmelites. He was ordained in 1907 and came to New York the following year to Our Lady of the Scapular. Up to 1926, he had been stationed in each house of the New York Carmelites. His height gave him an imposing presence and his strict religious observance placed fear in some hearts. He included many religious sisters among his friends. He corresponded with them, was present at important ceremonies of their lives and counseled them in times of trial. Especially is this true of the Carmelite Sisters of the Aged and Infirm though he was very reticent and humble about his assistance to them.

Charles Francis Ronayne, Doctor of Theology, who was a consultor to a Roman congregation and former assistant general, came to the United States from Rome in 1927. Magennis had invited Flanagan to accompany him to the 1928 Eucharistic Congress in Australia and he agreed. Flanagan appointed Ronayne his vicar while he was away. The ship had hardly left the harbor when Ronayne assumed complete control. There was a rumor that was substantiated in time that Magennis took Flanagan with him to leave him in Australia as the superior and then have Ronayne in charge in New York. Word of this got to Flanagan in Australia and it was said he took the first ship home. Lawrence Flanagan returned to find himself accused of mismanagement of funds but he was saved by an alert housekeeper at Saint Simon Stock who preserved material Ronayne told her to destroy. He also found a surprise in Manhattan. A new priory with an elevator had been built at Our Lady of the Scapular. Flanagan cleared himself and Ronayne left the order and priesthood. He later returned and was at Saint Albert's until his death in 1950.

The triennial chapters of 1931, 1934, 1937 and 1940 were all held at Saint Simon Stock. At each one, Lawrence Flanagan was reelected provincial. There was not universal suffrage at these chapters. Each definator and prior had voice as did a representative from each house of more than three members. This allowed a small facility like Saint Simon's to host chapters. One significant piece of legislation that raised hairs in Rome was that of the 1934 chapter permitting an allowance of \$2 per week.

Flanagan thought that besides the apostolates committed to the Carmelites, it was important to do missions, novenas and weekend assistance in parishes. He would send his priests far and wide and especially to country areas during the summer vacation season. The proceeds from all this work was deposited in the bank for the future expansion of the commissariate. William Canary was the Carmelite lawyer at that time and when money was left in wills simply for "charity," he would make the Carmelites that charity. Flanagan was generous to those who solicited donations and he used his influence to gain jobs, an improved position or an apartment for those who asked him. He oversaw the construction of O'Connor Hall at Saint Albert's in 1927-9.

When Peter Elias Magennis finished his term as prior general in 1931, Lawrence Flanagan

invited him to come to the Bronx. He gave missions, conferences, novenas and substituted for priests. He stated the work given him by Flanagan was to expand the order by founding new houses.

Magennis continued what the Carmelites believed was a longtime friendship with the two Irish born Monsignors Cherry of Brooklyn. They were always going to speak to Bishop Molloy about obtaining a parish in Brooklyn for the Carmelites. It never transpired.

Lawrence Diether was the provincial of the Chicago based Most Pure Heart of Mary Province for 1924-36. He and Flanagan were on cordial terms and assisted one another in many ways. One of these was Diether's loan of John Haffert to be the novice master at Middletown. No cash was involved but a New York Carmelite had to take Haffert's place among the Chicago Carmelites. This was done on a yearly basis and Albert Daly was the first. He was followed by Sean Reid, Robert C. Murphy, Charles Grahame, Denis Murphy and then the final one, Columba Staunton. Those in this exchange formed friendships that endured for many years. When Denis McCarthy and John McGrath were sent home from Rome for what was called "heresy" (smoking), Diether took them into his theology program in Chicago.

When Peter Elias Magennis asked for money to restore San Martino ai Monti, a Carmelite church in Rome, Flanagan sent him \$5,000 for which the general was very grateful. In 1930, Lawrence Flanagan felt the time was right and requested of Rome that his houses be formed into a province. This was granted March 24, 1931 and the first officials of the province were appointed by the general curia of the order. Commissary General Flanagan became Provincial Flanagan and attended the 1931 General Chapter in Rome as a provincial. This chapter elected Hilary Doswald, a German born member of the Chicago Province as prior general.

Flanagan was the banker for Hilary Doswald. After the Italian invasion of Ethiopia in 1935, Doswald was fearful of war in Europe and sent Flanagan funds to safeguard by depositing them in the United States. Later, he also sent securities.

Titus Brandsma visited both American provinces in 1935. He came to the Manhattan priory from the Chicago province and from there, John Howe, a professed student, drove him to Tarrytown and then to Saint Albert's where he stayed and lectured to the novices and Carmelites.

On January 5, 1929, Hilary Doswald and Columba Downey arrived at Nablus in what was then British Palestine and opened a mission. Father Simon Schmitt and Brother Aloysius Scafidi, both of the Chicago Province, formed the community. With the assistance of an Arab, they ran a school for boys. The purpose of the foundation was the return of the Carmelites to the Holy Land from where they originated. Theological students were sent to Nablus for their studies. Those from this province who did so were Kevin Morrissey, Albert Schwartz and Joseph Einer Larsen. It was a difficult life there and the Moslem-Jewish conflicts added tension to the situation. Somehow, Morrissey and Larsen endured through it all and were ordained in the Holy Land May 21, 1932.

Lawrence Flanagan sent his college students to Catholic University in Washington and had them reside at the Saint Therese House of Studies of the Chicago Province for the 1933 and 1935 years. In 1935, because of overcrowding, Flanagan rented a house on Randolph Street and Celestine Fitzpatrick was placed in charge of the students. He then purchased a house on Newton Street to

where the students moved in May, 1939. Whitefriars Hall, the theology house of the Chicago Province, was completed for the 1940-1 school year and seventeen of the province's students resided there while six remained at Newton Street where Berthold Forrester was their prefect.

In 1940, Lawrence Flanagan bought five acres from the Atonement Fathers and Brothers with the idea of building his own residence. He sold the Newton Street house to the Franciscans, Third Order Regular, in 1941 and beginning with that September, all the New York students resided at Whitefriars Hall. Some college students attended Mount Carmel College at Niagara Falls, a house of the Most Pure Heart of Mary Province.

The practice of sending students each year to Rome to study theology at San Alberto was continued by Flanagan. Emmanuel Hourihan, John Howe, Columba Staunton and Alphonsus Galligan went in 1938. They remained there until September, 1939 when Hilary Doswald closed San Alberto because war in Europe seemed imminent. Doswald himself went to Switzerland for a time and then came to New York to sit out the war at the Carmelite Sisters' Saint Patrick's Home in the Bronx.

Bishop John Cantwell visited Lawrence Flanagan in the Bronx and offered him the opportunity to build and staff a high school in Los Angeles. Flanagan and Patrick Russell left the Bronx for Los Angeles in January, 1934. Cantwell gave the Carmelites the site, land worth \$42,000, but they had to build the school. Patrick Russell remained in California and began the process of building a school for a September, 1934 opening. In a period of comparatively primitive communication, Russell tried to coordinate architects, builders and chancery officials in Los Angeles with Flanagan and his advisors in New York, three thousand miles away. Russell also had to return east for a chapter that June where he spoke of what had transpired to that point in Los Angeles. He was able to open Mount Carmel High School that September with one class in the auditorium of the local parish, Saint Raphael's. The Carmelites lived in a cottage nearby. Meanwhile the school building was under construction and Bishop Cantwell dedicated it in January, 1935. That fall, Bishop Cantwell transferred Saint Raphael's Parish to the care of the Carmelites. It was a small parish having an income in 1936 of only \$15,600 but the rectory was used as a residence for the high school teachers. At the start of the 1936-7 school year, the Mount Carmel enrollment was 205.

1938 was the first graduation of Mount Carmel and Kilian Lynch came from Tarrytown to the west coast to be the speaker. Lawrence Flanagan had invested over \$100,000 of the province's money in Los Angeles and according to his calculations, was not getting a good return on his investment. He was constantly trying to increase the money sent from California. In spite of this, permission was given to build a gym and indoor pool complex. Those stationed at Mount Carmel felt they were necessary to compete with other schools. It was dedicated in 1940, the year enrollment had risen to 450. There were thirteen Carmelites, living in four different locations, stationed at the school that year. It was not until 1950 that a priory to house all the Carmelites was built adjacent to the school complex.

When Carmel Lynn was the pastor of Saint Raphael's, he saw the need for and had the desire to build a parish grammar school but the parish debt precluded any construction. His successor,

Kevin Flanagan, paid off the entire debt in the years 1943-4. He then made some initial contact with the chancery office about erecting a school. He went ahead and built it not thinking, presumably, that any more chancery office input was required. The school opened in 1947 with the Adrian Dominican Sisters staffing it.

Antonio Franco and Alberto Consalvo, Italian Carmelites known to many members of both provinces from the time of their Roman studies, came to the United States in 1938 and visited the houses of both provinces.

The Scapular Militia was established in the spring of 1941. It was located in a house in the 28th Street parish and had as its purpose the providing of a scapular to every American serviceman. Hilary Doswald said “[Gabriel] Pausback and I” established it but a few years before, Donal O’Callaghan, then a student, presented the concept in an article in *The Sword*. When Gabriel Pausback left in 1944 to visitate Carmelite houses in Australia as the assistant general, John Mathias Haffert was engaged to replace him. Haffert had been a student with the Chicago Carmelites and after leaving, taught French at Saint Albert’s, Middletown. He published *Mary in Her Scapular Promise* in 1940 and the book enjoyed a very large circulation. After several abortive attempts, Haffert began the publication of *The Scapular* with the January-February, 1942 issue. This bimonthly magazine was to be the organ of the Scapular Militia. Donal O’Callaghan was ordained in 1943 and was destined to join the Militia which he did on the completion of his studies in 1944.

The *Carmelite Review* was the monthly publication of the Most Pure Heart of Mary Province and in 1941, Lawrence Flanagan agreed to having a New York edition featuring pertinent material and being mailed from his province. This arrangement endured until 1944 when the number of subscribers and income declined to a point where it was no longer a worthwhile venture.

When the United States entered World War II in 1941, there was a call for chaplains. Finbar Lynn, John McGrath and Alphonsus Galligan all served. Before the war, there was between the major Irish and New York superiors a problem involved with what we might call the Irish Shuttle. Some felt the young Irish priests who worked in America returned to Ireland old and worn out and unable to assist their mother province. The situation came to a head after the well educated and talented Kilian Lynch came over to teach at Marymount College, Tarrytown. Brocard Taylor, a Lawrence Flanagan foe, instigated the election of Lynch as the prior of Kinsale. After much negotiation, Lynch was relieved of the office but an agreement was made to give financial compensation to the Irish Province for Lynch and the others who served in the United States. In 1939, Irish working in the New York Province were to choose their province. When that time came, the agreement seems to have been forgotten.

Mass stipends were sent from the United States to both Ireland and Rome as a form of assistance. Because of the lack of mail service due to the World War II, no funds could change hands so Flanagan was sent to Ireland after the war and made a settlement in negotiations.

The Provincial Chapter of 1943 was held at Saint Simon Stock. Lawrence Flanagan made it clear he was not interested in another term. Kilian Lynch was elected over Mel Daly by a margin of five votes, The chapter of 1946 was held at Saint Albert’s, Lynch being reelected and houses in

Auburn, New York and Pasadena, California were approved. With the war ended, a chapter was held in Rome in the spring of 1947 and Kilian Lynch was elected Prior General. That June 16, the definitors and priors met at Saint Albert's to elect his successor. Patrick Russell was chosen to complete Kilian Lynch's term as provincial.

Chapter 8

Life in the 30's and 40's

Because of limited personnel and his hands on style of management, Lawrence Flanagan made many changes of his priests. In thirteen years, there were three pastors at Our Lady of the Scapular: Philip McGouran (1926-8), Vincent Smyth (1928-34) and Elias Holland (1937-9). Stephen McGleenan (1937-9) succeeded them and after a rift with Flanagan was sent to California because the war prevented him from returning to Ireland. Until the appointment of Kevin Flanagan (1940-3), Lawrence Flanagan served as pastor.

The parish was the benefactor of two wills. Robert Green, a parishioner, composed his own will leaving his assets to a few including the Carmelite Church. The will was so complicated and contained so many conditions that only the lawyers benefitted from the will. Another parishioner, John McCarthy, left his house on 30th Street to the parish for use as a convent for the school's sisters when his nephew, then living in the house, passed on. The nephew died in 1933 and because he had assumed as his own his late wife's relatives, the title was clouded. A number of attempts by Flanagan to utilize the house for sisters who would work in the parish were turned down by the archdiocese. The notion of using it as a provincial house was abandoned and the house was finally sold in the term of Kilian Lynch.

1939 was the golden jubilee of Our Lady of the Scapular and Flanagan, acting pastor, wanted an event worthy of the occasion. The Mass was on Sunday, November 12, with students from Saint Albert's and Washington forming the choir and serving the Mass. Flanagan was the celebrant with John Maher and Kieran Hickey as deacon and subdeacon. Monsignor William Courtney, pastor of neighboring Saint Stephen's, preached. Archbishop Spellman presided but was unable to attend the clergy luncheon at the Commodore Hotel. Monsignor Michael Lavelle replaced him as the luncheon speaker. In the spring, a dinner dance was held with entertainment by stars of Broadway and vaudeville.

Irish born Sean Reid, pastor 1943-64, revived in many ways the Irish connections of the parish. His promotion of the moral fitness of William O'Dwyer to be the city's mayor was frowned upon by the chancery office and when Reid championed at O'Dwyer's inauguration equal rights for Afro Americans and more welfare for the needy, the chancery office was once again annoyed.

The parish had incurred a debt in building the new priory and debts remained from the original land purchase and church construction. Smyth had consolidated all of these into the one debt of \$200,000 which was finally satisfied by Sean Reid in 1946.

Monsignor Brady, involved in hospital work, offered Vincent Smyth a new parish for the Carmelites if they would give up Our Lady of the Scapular and Bellevue Hospital. Though three meetings were held while Flanagan was in California, nothing came from this proposal for it seems Brady was acting without authority and speaking on his own.

The parish lost some territory when the Midtown Tunnel was opened in 1939. The tunnel

brought about the suppression of the Parish of Saint Gabriel and its territory was divided among the neighboring parishes. The Carmelites' 33rd Street was taken from their parish and given to Sacred Hearts. There was nothing that could be done but Flanagan did write to the chancery office expressing his unhappiness.

There were some complaints in the early 1940's from the chancery office about the service given at Bellevue. Discussions with the officials took place and it appears matters were exaggerated. It did give the Carmelites an opportunity to present the large amount of work being done in the hospital.

The original 29th Street priory, converted to the school sisters' convent, was deeded to the parish from the Carmelites. This was part of Cardinal Spellman's plan to have all parish facilities owned by the parish corporation. The price given the Carmelites was the same they paid more than fifty years before.

Elias Vella was made the pastor of Saint Simon Stock when Gerard O'Farrell became the Commissary General in 1926 on the death of Denis O'Connor. Louis Gerhard became pastor in 1928 but left for his native Australia the following year. Patrick Russell then became pastor and built the parish high school. The Sisters of Mercy staffed the parish schools and lived in two adjacent houses on Ryer Avenue. Construction costs and running expenses brought a heavy debt to the parish.

February, 1927, a congress of the Scapular Confraternity was held at Saint Simon Stock to mark the seven hundredth anniversary of the approval of the Carmelite rule. Hugh Devlin preached at the Benediction. Entertainment in the school hall followed the religious services. Films were made of the event. After being shown locally, they were stored for the next congress in one hundred years!

The summer of 1930 saw the return of Mel Daly from his studies in Rome and he was appointed to Saint Simon Stock. That school year of 1930-1 had an enrollment of 466 in the grammar school and ninety-five in the high school. The first high school graduation was in 1933 with Lawrence Flanagan as the main speaker. For that first graduation, the students published the first yearbook, *The Mantuan*, featuring material of the two Carmelite faculty members, Kieran Hickey and Berthold Forrester. Flanagan was so proud of the publication, he sent a copy to Cardinal Hayes. In 1934, Mel Daly was appointed pastor beginning a term that would endure for twenty-seven years. It is difficult to state the exact debt of Saint Simon Stock because of the constant additions made to the school building. With the usual collections and additional fund raisers, Daly was able to reduce the debt. He had the idea of building a modern convent for the large staff of sisters who taught at the schools. The main obstacle was the assembly of parcels of land for an area large enough to be the site of the convent.

The silver jubilee of the parish was celebrated in 1947 with the usual religious ceremonies and a jubilee dinner at the Commodore Hotel. A souvenir journal giving the history of the parish in both words and pictures was published to commemorate the occasion.

Peter Elias Magennis was pleased with the nearly completed O'Connor Hall at Saint Albert's

when he saw it in 1928. Lawrence Flanagan was able to bring the Corpus Christi Carmelite Sisters to Saint Albert's to do the domestic work. They were given the original house, "The Thistles," for their residence.

John Maher had become prior of Saint Albert's in 1933 and followed the academic program of Catholic University with whom he hoped to become affiliated with. The Saint Albert's faculty sent Flanagan suggestions concerning candidates for the brotherhood. They wished to have twenty-one as the cutoff age. They also asked for instructional materials and an improvement in faculty regarding age and qualification. The novitiate with John Haffert as novice master was also located at Saint Albert's. Part of it was the first building the Carmelites had constructed on the property. Maher was anxious to speak in schools to recruit students but time did not permit him to do this. He had employed John Mathias Haffert to teach French and Haffert began a students' French publication. He sent a copy of *La Presse de St. Albert* to Hilary Doswald. The general was not amused. He criticized the publication to John Maher at whose feet he laid the blame for its defects.

Albert Daly (1940-3) succeeded Maher as the prior. The night of February 13, 1943, a fire totally destroyed the Grey house which was used for the kitchen and dining room. It was to this structure that the novitiate building had been attached. The burned building was replaced by a new one that included a faculty dining room. The Corpus Christi Carmelite Sisters had been able to obtain a house in Middletown and commuted to the seminary. When their number was increased to six and given additional duties, a house on the grounds was given three of them to use as their convent.

The Marian, picturing and describing seminary life for the purpose of recruiting students, was published in yearbook form in 1944. At the end of World War II, "The Thistles" was modernized and expanded. Kilian Lynch began a landscaping project on the grounds using the professed students as his laborers with he, himself, on hand to direct them.

While John Maher was stationed at Saint Albert's, he acted as the pastor of Holy Name Church in Otisville which was a mission of Middletown's Our Lady of Mount Carmel. During his tenure, parishioners petitioned for him to reside there and also raised questions about the disposition of funds and church improvements. Cardinal Hayes was brought into the situation and Lawrence Flanagan drew his attention to the truth of matters in Otisville. Joseph Larsen cared for Otisville when John Maher was the pastor of Our Lady of Mount Carmel in Middletown. For the seventy-fifth anniversary of the parish in 1941, Larsen added a vestibule to the church and put running water into Lyceum Hall, the parish center. Lawrence Flanagan was the celebrant for the anniversary Mass and he was very pleased at this as Otisville had been his first assignment in the United States.

John Maher wanted to build a mission church in nearby Burlingham where the area's summer vacationers attended Mass in the auditorium of the R. H. Macy camp. Patrick Tobin donated the land for the church and it was to be named after his patron. The plans seem not to have gone any further. Maher had a few disputes with Saint Joseph's, the other Middletown parish, over boundaries and insisted there were none but the chancery office showed Lawrence Flanagan the boundaries drawn in Cardinal Hayes' own hand. When Berthold Forrester's time in Washington at the Newton

Street house was to come to an end in 1941, John Maher tried to have Flanagan assign him to Mount Carmel. He succeeded but Forrester had to work in Bellevue during the week and serve at Mount Carmel on the weekends. In 1945, Our Lady of the Scapular, Unionville, the last of Mount Carmel's missions was started. It was located in the former Saint Paul's Methodist Church of that village.

The Carmelites at Transfiguration Parish in Tarrytown were also the chaplains for the Mercy Sisters and the Sisters of the Sacred Heart of Mary. Both were located on the high, long hill above the town. Louis Gerhard was the pastor (1922-4) and was succeeded by Dominic Hastings who served until 1933. Vincent Smyth then served as pastor until 1937. Kilian Lynch had come to Tarrytown in 1931 to teach philosophy at Marymount. He added to his duties that of pastor after Smyth returned to Ireland. John Anthony Wholley was named pastor when Kilian Lynch was elected provincial in 1943. Wholley had come to Transfiguration as an assistant in 1934 and would serve as pastor eighteen years until 1961.

The fortieth anniversary of the parish was celebrated in 1938 with a solemn Mass on May 15 and vespers that evening followed by a social. Wholley was in charge of the journal published for the occasion. In 1942, Lawrence Flanagan had located a house for sale close to Transfiguration Church and thought it would be a good residence for his college level professed students. He was unable to obtain it because the Archdiocese of New York would not allow any more tax exempt property in Westchester County.

The golden jubilee of the parish was celebrated in the fall of 1947. Helene Margaret wrote the parish history for the souvenir booklet published to commemorate the event.

After he was elected provincial in 1943, Kilian Lynch continued to teach at Marymount College. One of his first efforts was to increase the income of the province. He taxed each parish in addition to the money that would be sent from the community's account. Lynch was anxious to move the novitiate from Saint Albert's and establish it as a separate facility. He tried without success to have Cardinal Spellman change his policy of not buying taxable property and turning it into tax exempt. What Lynch had in mind was the R. H. Macy Camp in Burlingham near Middletown. He then turned to Bishop James Kearney of Rochester, a friend he knew through Marymount. Kearney told Lynch of a house in Auburn that was in possession of the city. The Carmelites obtained it, the mansion of Theodore Case, at auction March, 1946 for \$15,000.

Kilian Lynch was reelected provincial that summer of 1946 and he went forward with his plans to open the novitiate in Auburn that September. Patrick Russell was the first prior. The professed students spent that summer at Auburn cleaning and preparing the Case mansion. Bishop Kearney came for the dedication on September 7 and there was an open house on the next day.

Through a friend of Sean Reid, an offer of a high school in Salem, MA, was made to the Carmelites but Lynch had to turn it down because at the time, it seemed that the province was going to have a high school and a parish in Pasadena, CA. Unfortunately, the property Bishop McGucken had for the high school was deemed by the Carmelites to be too small for such an institution.

Throughout most of Lynch's years as provincial, John Mathias Haffert fueled through the

Scapular Militia the controversy between the cloth scapular and the scapular medal. Hilary Doswald, the general, wanted no articles published on this until the order could make a statement. With his own uncle Father John Haffert, Doswald and in articles, Haffert kept pushing his position that the cloth scapular be preferred. The policy Doswald eventually established was that the Church had approved of the medal and thus was a substitute for the cloth scapular.

The Carmelites' general chapter, the first since the start of World War II, was set for May, 1947 in Rome. Kilian Lynch was elected prior general, the first from his province. It was said that the two province delegates, Donal O'Callaghan and Berthold Forrester, did yeoman work at the chapter. O'Callaghan and Kilian's brother, Elias Lynch, united the English speakers behind Kilian. Berthold Forrester was the gatekeeper for those wishing to speak with Kilian. Berthold had brought liquid refreshments, unavailable in war torn Europe, and dispensed them to those waiting for an audience with Kilian Lynch.

Chapter 9

The Old Houses 1950-90

The election of Kilian as general in 1947 brought about a special election for provincial. Patrick Russell was elected to finish Lynch's term and then was elected in his own right to two full terms in 1949 and 1952. There was much progress in his years: the opening of Mount Carmel High School in Auburn, a priory and additions to Mount Carmel High School in Los Angeles, an addition to the Williamstown novitiate, the acquisition of a retreat house in Tamaqua, the establishment of a priory in Pottsville and the affiliation of the province's college program with Saint Bonaventure University.

He was succeeded for two terms (1955-61) by Donal O'Callaghan who purchased land in Rhode Island for a college and theology level seminary. He also began a building fund drive which was successful but the attained goal was below the amount needed for construction. The seminary was never built and over the years the land was gradually sold. During O'Callaghan's time, the sending of men to the missions in what was then Southern Rhodesia was begun. He also began the province's cemetery at Saint Albert's reintering there those that had been buried at Calvary Cemetery in Queens, NY.

Richard Nagle succeeded O'Callaghan and was reelected in 1964 but was elected an assistant general the following year. Again, there was a special election and Lawrence Mooney was made provincial. He was chosen again at the regular chapters in 1967 and 1970. Mooney had to deal with the changes and turmoil following Vatican II. Many left the order and the priesthood. Debts previously contracted had to be met and Christopher Byrnes as provincial treasurer was of great assistance in doing this.

The terms of Charles Haggerty (1973-9) were occupied with personnel problems and the establishment of new sites for students' education and formation. The next provincial, Thomas McGinnis (1979-85), was faced with staggering debts and no rising income. Mario Esposito as provincial treasurer was of assistance to McGinnis in facing these problems. The two terms of Matthias Des Lauriers (1985-91) were devoted to increasing the assets of the province with a view of caring for personnel especially the growing number of older members.

The long dreamed of chapel at Saint Albert's was constructed in the late 1950's along with a new kitchen, dining room, study hall and recreation area. The first year of college at Saint Albert's endured until 1961 when the entrance into the novitiate after high school was resumed. Enrollment at Saint Albert's had declined to forty-eight in 1967-8 but gradually rose to 100 in 1971-2. From that point there was a gradual decline to thirty-four in 1976-7.

The dormitory facilities were stretched to the limits for some of these years due to the residence also at Saint Albert's of the college students attending Orange County Community College for two years. Even though team teaching decreased the need for classroom space at Saint Albert's, the former private Mass chapels were converted into classrooms which freed the first floor of

O'Connor Hall for use as a dormitory. The low enrollment in 1976-7 and with few prospects for September, 1977 prompted Charles Haggerty to hold a province wide meeting at Saint Albert's. The general sentiment at that meeting was to close the high school program. That was the decision officially made by the council and provincial. The joint novitiate program began in "The Thistles" that year but the remainder of the facilities remained idle for two years. With some remodeling, the Spiritual Life Center was opened but was not successful because every seminary in the area had become such a retreat house.

The students attending Orange County Community College remained at Saint Albert's for the 1977-8 school year. Transferring to Catholic University after two years had become difficult and the prospect of selling Saint Joseph's in Washington loomed so it was felt that a four year college in the New York area should be the course to follow. Iona College was selected and the students lived for one year in an idle convent in Norwalk, Connecticut. The following year, Brandsma Hall in Purchase had been renovated and was ready to receive the students.

The college level residence at Bancroft Place in Washington was not ideal and the crowded conditions at Whitefriars Hall both called for large permanent quarters in Washington. Because of the large legacy obtained by Donal O'Callaghan from James McElroy, the funds for such a building were available. Facilities for an in house college and rooms for about 100 students were built on Harewood Road, NW, on the land purchased years before by Lawrence Flanagan. The building was financed by a bond issue and opened in February, 1965. The concept was doomed from the beginning. There was no personnel for the in house college, students began to leave in large numbers and maintenance of the large structure was very difficult. Classrooms and dormitory rooms were rented but sale of the entire building seemed to be the solution. This was achieved by sale to the Little Sisters of the Poor in 1979. The seminary of the Missionhurst community on Lawrence Street was rented for two years and after that the theologians moved into residence at Whitefriars Hall.

Novices and professed students living together at Auburn was not desirable so another site for the novitiate was sought. It was found at Williamstown, Massachusetts in Thorvale Farm, a large house with 700 acres of forest. It was purchased in spring, 1952 from the estate of Sinclair Lewis and renamed Mount Carmel. The first class of novices to use it were received in Auburn and went to Williamstown on September 9, 1952. Almost immediately, it was realized the accommodations were cramped and plans were made for an addition. It was dedicated in June, 1955. Problems appeared in the radiant heating system and after a long process of arbitration, repairs were made. From 1958 to 1963, the college students, transferred from Auburn, shared the facilities with the novices. This endured until they moved to the rented quarters on Bancroft Street in Washington.

The novitiate remained at Mount Carmel until 1967 and in the following year, the Christian Life Center began its operation there. Retreat and renewal programs as well as family weekends were offered. The novitiate returned to Mount Carmel for 1974-77 and again in 1985.

The Diocese of Rochester began in the 1950's a massive expansion in high school education. Auburn and the Carmelites were designated for one of the new schools. Land southeast of the city

and near Lake Owasco was purchased and a drive for funds was conducted in the Auburn parishes. Mount Carmel was completed in time for opening in September 1955. Immediately, the facilities had to be increased and an addition was ready for September, 1957. When it was discovered that the entering class in September, 1970 would be significantly lower than normal and that the city of Auburn was building a consolidated high school almost within the shadow of Mount Carmel, fifty members of the province attended a meeting at Saint Albert's in the spring of 1970. After presentations and discussion, the vote was to close the school that June rather than have a lingering death.

The city of Auburn purchased Mount Carmel to use as a middle school and the convent was sold to house Auburn's education offices. Each parish received the money they raised for the original construction. Whitefriars had become the Carmelite faculty residence and was rented for use as a center for recovering alcoholics. After purchasing some of the surrounding land, the First Presbyterian Church of Auburn purchased the house in 1976. Some of the Mount Carmel faculty went to teach in Rochester's Catholic high schools and lived in a residence purchased there.

Establishing the novitiate at Auburn made it the first house established outside the Archdiocese of New York. Attempts to have foundations in a number of other areas were unsuccessful. Cardinal O'Hara in Philadelphia gave Leonard Love and Robert Caruana teaching positions in two Philadelphia Catholic high schools for the 1954-5 school year. The next year, the cardinal provided for the Carmelites a house in Pottsville, Pennsylvania and four teaching positions at Nativity High School. Besides teaching, the Carmelites assisted in the local parishes.

When the Diocese of Allentown was established in 1961, the Carmelites fell under its jurisdiction. It was with some surprise that at the end of the 1975-6 school year, the order was told that its services were no longer needed. The Carmelites owned no property there so it was simple to pack up personal possessions but it was sad to leave twenty-one years of service behind.

In 1954, the province bought a home for the aged in Tamaqua in the Archdiocese of Philadelphia from the Franciscan Sisters of Glenriddle. Patrick Russell planned on opening a retreat house in the facility. Though remodeled and then dedicated in December, 1954, the first retreat did not take place until the spring of 1955. Because of the distance to rail and bus transportation, there was a scarcity of clients. When no buyer could be found and the sisters refused to take back the property, Donal O'Callaghan refused to complete purchase payments. The sisters were forced to repossess the property in 1961.

Mount Carmel High School, Los Angeles had its first priory in 1950 and put on additions to the school in both 1951 and 1954. The parish of Saint Raphael in these years was in the pastorate of John Maher. At the 1957 chapter of the Most Pure Heart of Mary Province held at Niagara Falls, Kilian Lynch, prior general, announced that both these California houses were transferred to their province. His intention was that the California houses would join their Texas and Arizona houses to form a commissariat and eventually a new province. Though the high school was totally owned by the New York Carmelites, there was no exchange of funds. The intended plan was never accomplished.

The 700th anniversary of the Brown Scapular was in 1951. Each house of the province from Los Angeles to Auburn had a large and extravagant celebration of the event. Kilian Lynch was present for a good number of the festivities.

Developments in the neighborhood of Our Lady of the Scapular, eliminated many residences for parishioners. During the pastorate of Sean Reid (1943-64) dependence on Irish organizations was vital not only for financial support but also for attendance. Donal O'Callaghan was also active among these Irish societies and was able to obtain from them the support needed to beautify the church and attract people to the various devotions held there.

The Scapular Militia had various locations in the facilities of Our Lady of the Scapular. Donal O'Callaghan was able to purchase a four story tenement on 28th Street and convert it into offices for the Little Flower Society, the Scapular Militia, *The Scapular* magazine, the Marian Library and living quarters for those engaged in these works. The Marian Center was opened in 1954, the Marian Year.

In the early 1960's New York City was planning the renovation of the area of Our Lady of the Scapular. Called Bellevue South, the city intended the renovation to provide housing for Bellevue's personnel while the parish was interested in the retention of parishioners in the area. The Marian Center, the original priory and then the sisters' convent as well as the school, which closed in 1970, were all demolished and payment made to the Carmelites or the parish.

The Scapular magazine had been begun by John Mathias Haffert in 1941. Stephen Breen succeeded him and was the editor until he was ordained a priest. Thomas McGinnis then became the first Carmelite editor. In the 1960's Pius Gagnon became the editor and changed the style and title of the magazine with the October, 1966 issue. Renamed *Response*, it endured until 1968 when rising costs and low circulation brought about its closure.

The dream of decades was realized at Transfiguration in Tarrytown when John Anthony Wholley opened the parish school in September, 1949. He also purchased a large mansion nearby for the convent of the Sisters of Mercy staffing the school. In the pastorate of Carmel Lynn (1961-7), it was evident that the original church was structurally unsound and too small for the growing parish.

A parishioner and architect, Robert A. Green, designed a circular church which also included a large hall and priory. It was dedicated by Cardinal Spellman in 1967. During construction, the Carmelites lived in the main house of the Ditmar estate since the priory, the Lourdes shrine and the original church were leveled. Mel Daly ended his twenty-seven years as pastor of Saint Simon Stock in 1961. He had built a convent for the Sisters of Mercy on Ryer Avenue and it was dedicated in 1961.

Gerard McCarthy was the next pastor. He remodeled the church interior and worked with residents and politicians in an attempt to stabilize the neighborhood. Co-op City and the suburbs drew away many parishioners and few newcomers replaced them. McCarthy died in 1968 after a brief illness and Bartholomew Parsons replaced him. When Martin Miller became pastor in 1973, he began the parochial activity of reaching out to new residents with social programs. The parish grammar school was part of this and it eventually had a large enrollment and drew much attention because of its quality education.

Berthold Forrester (1950-53) succeeded John Maher as pastor of Middletown's Our Lady of Mount Carmel. Emmanuel Hourihan as pastor (1953-64) built the parish grammar school on Waywayanda Avenue across from Saint Albert's on land he had purchased from the seminary. The school and its convent were both opened in September, 1956. While James Reilly was pastor (1964-73), the mission of Holy Name in Otisville was taken from the Carmelites and made a parish with an archdiocesan priest as pastor. This change was a total surprise to the Carmelites in the area. At the mission of Saint Paul's, Bullville, the wooden church burned down and a new brick church replaced it in 1985. A larger church had to be built at Holy Cross in South Centreville. This was at a different site and the original church was moved there to serve as a parish hall.

When the Marian Center was sold in the course of the Bellevue South project, a three story duplex apartment house in Maspeth, Queens, was purchased. Beginning in May, 1971, the provincial administration, the provinces' fund raising activities, the Vocation Department and the Third Order operated from there. It also housed many foreign Carmelite visitors as they passed through to their various destinations. A search in the Diocese of Brooklyn resulted in the offer to the Carmelites of Saint Thomas Aquinas Parish, Ninth Street and Fourth Avenue, in Brooklyn. The Maspeth house was sold in 1982 and all of its staff and operations moved to quarters at Saint Thomas where Mario Esposito was the first pastor. The Carmelites remained at the parish until June 30, 2001.

In 1979 Thomas McGinnis received an offer from Archbishop Edward McCarthy of Miami to staff a high school in the Boca Raton area. Fourteen parishes banded together to raise funds for the school which was named Pope John Paul II High School. Michael Welch was named principal and went to Florida to supervise construction and prepare for the opening of school in September, 1980, with freshmen and sophomores. The gymnasium was built during the 1981-2 school year and the first graduation was in May, 1983.

It was always a dream of the Province of Saint Elias to have foreign missions. This came to fruition in 1959 when Paul Feeley and Charles Haggerty went to the then Southern Rhodesia to join the Irish Carmelites in mission work. Between then and 1967, Martin Miller, Matthias Des Lauriers, James Vargo and Stephen Josten joined them. When they tried to be stationed in one area and live together in community, the bishop of Umtali, their diocese, was not pleased. Given an ultimatum, they would not give up their plan and had to return to the United States.

Simeon Marro and Bede Mulligan established a hermitage in 1970 in Florence, Pennsylvania on property left to the Diocese of Greenburg. When John Howe was chaplain at the Bedford, Massachusetts, Veterans Administration Hospital, Albert Daly and Robert Tracy joined him. A house was purchased near the hospital and the chaplains were joined by other Carmelites who taught at Saint John's Prep in Danvers. Chaplaincies for the Carmelite Sisters for the Aged and Infirm at Rhinbeck and Trumbull were undertaken and endured until the senior Carmelites involved could no longer do the work.

Bishop Edward Broderick of Albany offered Lawrence Mooney the staffing of a parish, Saint Joseph's in Troy, New York. Vincent McDonald was the first Carmelite pastor and other

Carmelites, teaching in the area's Catholic High Schools, lived in the parish house.

The formation program of the province had consisted in the late 1940's of high school, one year of college at Saint Albert's followed by the novitiate at Whitefriars in Auburn, New York and then two years of college there. Except for one or two students being sent each year to Rome for theology, these studies were done at Whitefriars Hall in Washington, DC.

This in house education program resulted in no degrees but this situation was remedied by affiliation to Saint Bonaventure University in 1951 with the proviso that college be done in four years and two summers be spent on the Bonaventure campus taking courses. In 1958 the site of the Carmelite college was changed to Williamstown where it remained until 1963 when it was moved to a rented residence on Bancroft Place in Washington, DC. The theologians moved into residence there but continued classes at Whitefriars Hall. The college level students attended Catholic University or another local college.

The Washington community moved in 1965 across town to the newly constructed Saint Joseph's. The novices who made their profession that year were sent to Mount Carmel, Niagara Falls, Canada for college with the Chicago Carmelites. The following year a pilot program had some students attending Orange County community College. In 1967, attendance there was begun for all Saint Albert's high school graduates.

In 1968, due to a disastrous fire at Niagara Falls, the professed students who were there for college transferred to Washington schools or to Marquette University. That same year saw the end of classes at Whitefriars Hall and the start of the Washington Theological Coalition, later to be called Union. The novitiate was transferred in 1969 to Saint Joseph's in Washington and in 1974 the novitiate remained in Washington for one semester and was at Williamstown for the other semester. At the same time (1974), the novitiate was placed at the completion of college.

A four year college program began at Iona college in 1978 with the students residing for one year at a convent in Norwalk, CT and then at in 1979 at Brandsma Hall in Purchase, NY. This was a program shared by both provinces and they also began that same year a joint novitiate at "The Thistles" on the grounds of Saint Albert's. Previously, some students from the Most Pure Heart of Mary Province were in the Washington-Williamstown novitiate program.

The intern year at the completion of the novitiate was instituted in 1980 and the following year saw the start of a joint theology level formation program at Whitefriars Hall, a common formation manual and the establishment of one formation commission for both provinces.

The final arrangement then became: college, novitiate, internship, theology. Solemn profession, the diaconate and priesthood were joined with theological studies.

Chapter 10

The Most Recent Days

Matthias Des Lauriers was provincial (1985-91) at the time of Titus Brandsma's beatification in 1985. Besides members of the province attending the ceremonies in Rome, there was a Mass of celebration at Saint Patrick's Cathedral with a reception afterwards at the Netherlands Consulate. Another celebration was at Saint Matthew's Cathedral in Washington, DC.

Des Lauriers moved from Transfiguration, where he was pastor, to Brandsma Hall in Purchase when elected provincial. In 1986, the renovation of the chapel/school building at Saint Albert's began. Brandsma Hall was superfluous because of the placing of the novitiate to after the completion of college. The renovated building at Saint Albert's would house the provincial office, which had been at Purchase, and the development office as well as the National Shrine. Quarters were also available for the retired members of the province. Brandsma Hall was sold that September to the Pepsi Cola Corporation.

A house owned by Saint Thomas Aquinas Parish in Brooklyn became the site in 1988 for the pre-novitiate program. This housed those applicants who had completed college but needed some prerequisites for entering theological studies. That same year, the renovation of the convent for Our Lady of Mount Carmel School was approved as well as the construction of a church at the same Wayawayanda Avenue site. This involved the sale and trade in 1991 of land parcels between the parish and Saint Albert's. In 1989, both the priory and the church in downtown Middletown were sold.

The amalgamation of Manhattan's Our Lady of the Scapular and Saint Stephen's parishes in Manhattan began in 1988. The centennial of the arrival and of the first house of the New York Carmelites began with Mass at Our Lady of the Scapular on April 1, 1989 with John Cardinal O'Connor as the main celebrant and homilist. After repairs at Saint Stephen's had been approved, the move from Our Lady of the Scapular began around that Thanksgiving. The Saint Patrick's Day Parade of 1990 was dedicated to the Carmelites on their centennial. That April 21, the closing Mass for the centennial was at Saint Stephen's. The transfer from Our Lady of the Scapular to Saint Stephen's was completed in September, 1990. In January, 1991, the church and priory at Our Lady of the Scapular, both having been sold, were demolished.

At the 1991 chapter, Gary O'Brien was elected provincial (1991-4). In the summer of 1993, the vacant convent of Sacred Heart Parish in Tappan, New York was rented for the pre-novitiate program with the students taking classes at Seton Hall University or local colleges to prepare for theological studies. Matthias Des Lauriers was appointed to the Development Office continuing the work that John Horan and Robert Hulse had done before him.

The 1994 Chapter elected Mario Esposito provincial (1994-2000). This chapter also approved the province establishing the order in Trinidad and the prior general, Joseph Chalmers, requested that the province also undertake the establishment of the order in Vietnam. The members

of Donum Dei had been in Vietnam since the 1950's and had promoted the Carmelite Order among young men. Due to these efforts the first Vietnamese arrived at Tappan in May, 1998 to participate in the pre-novitiate program.

The missions of Holy Cross in South Centreville and Our Lady of the Scapular in Unionville were established as a parish in 1999. Since the province had no one to serve as pastor, the Archdiocese of New York appointed one of its priests. A wing for the Carmelite students at Saint Michael's parish in Trinidad was nearing completion in 1999 and Francis Amodio replaced John Horan as the formation director for the Trinidadian Carmelite students. At the chapter of 2000, Michael Driscoll was elected provincial.